

scrutiny



A Report of: Community & Adult Services Scrutiny Committee

Annual Report 2016 – 2017



City & County of Cardiff Council

COMMUNITY & ADULT SERVICES SCRUTINY

COMMITTEE MEMBERSHIP



[Councillor Ali Ahmed](#)



[Councillor Joseph Carter](#)



[Councillor Ralph Cook](#)



(Chairperson)

[Councillor Mary McGarry](#)



[Councillor Chris Davis](#)



[Councillor Julia Magill](#)



[Councillor Eleanor Sanders](#)

Councillor Chris Lomax was an active Member of this Committee for several years until September 2016, when he passed away unexpectedly. Members wish to pay tribute to his hard work, warmth and compassion; his wealth of experience is sorely missed.

TERMS OF REFERENCE OF THE COMMUNITY & ADULT SERVICES SCRUTINY COMMITTEE

To scrutinise, measure and actively promote improvement in the Council's performance in the provision of services and compliance with Council policies, aims and objectives in the area of community and adult services, including:

- Public and Private Housing
- Disabled Facilities Grants
- Community Safety
- Neighbourhood Renewal and Communities Next
- Advice & Benefit
- Consumer Protection
- Older Persons Strategy
- Adult Social Care
- Community Care Services
- Mental Health & Physical Impairment
- Commissioning Strategy
- Health Partnership

To assess the impact of partnerships with and resources and services provided by external organisations including the Welsh Government, joint local government services, Welsh Government-sponsored public bodies and quasi-departmental non-governmental bodies on the effectiveness of Council service delivery.

To report to an appropriate Cabinet or Council meeting on its findings and to make recommendations on measures which may enhance Council performance and service delivery in this area.

To be the Council's Crime and Disorder Committee as required by the Police and Justice Act 2006 and any re-enactment or modification thereof; and as full delegate of the Council to exercise all the powers and functions permitted under that Act.

CHAIR'S FOREWORD



Councillor Mary McGarry
Chair, Community & Adult Services Scrutiny Committee
March 2017

OVERVIEW

The Community and Adult Services Scrutiny Committee plays an important role in assessing service performance and informing service and policy development across a range of Council services, including all aspects of housing, neighbourhood renewal and adult social care. The Committee is also the Council's crime and disorder scrutiny committee.

One of the main aims of this Committee is to look at things from a service user and citizen perspective and use this to inform our observations and recommendations to the Cabinet. We have invited contributions to our work from carers, advocates, citizens, partners and the third sector as well as hearing from Council Members, officers, statutory organisations and feedback from service users. To date, 29 external witnesses have contributed at Committee this year.

Between June 2016 and March 2017, the Committee scrutinised the following topics:

- **Cabinet Responses** – Where the Committee receives a Cabinet Response that details whether the Cabinet has accepted or rejected recommendations made by the Committee following a task and finish Inquiry:
 - Information, Advice and Assistance for adult mental health service users.
 - Reducing Crime and Disorder in the Night Time Economy.
- **Deep Dives** – Where the Committee has undertaken an in-depth but short examination of a topic, which may result in recommendations to the Cabinet Member:
 - Council Housing Voids Management.
 - Disabled Adaptations.
 - Homelessness Target Setting.
- **Policy Development and/or Review** – Where the Committee has contributed to the Council's policy development processes, for example by considering draft policy documents, and/or where the Committee has considered the implementation of policies, looking at whether this has happened in a timely manner and the impact of

the policy, giving the Cabinet the opportunity to know Scrutiny Members' views about whether any changes are required:

- Communities First Annual Report and Way Forward.
 - Assessment – Social Services and Well Being (Wales) Act 2014.
 - Dementia Three-Year Action Plan: Progress Report.
 - Domiciliary Care.
 - Community Safety.
 - Direct Payments.
 - Private Rented Sector Housing.
 - Adult Safeguarding.
 - Regional Partnership Board – Health and Social Care Integration.
- **Pre decision** - Where the Committee has evaluated and commented on policy proposals prior to Cabinet, giving Cabinet the opportunity to know Scrutiny Members' views prior to making their decision:
 - Housing Strategy.
 - Recommissioning of Advice and Support Services (including floating support, gender specific support and advice).
 - Buildings Maintenance Framework recommissioning.
 - Direct Payments for Vulnerable People.
 - Corporate Plan.
 - Budgetary Proposals.
 - Rough Sleepers Strategy.
- **Monitoring Progress** - Where the Committee has undertaken monitoring of the Council's progress in implementing actions previously agreed:
 - 'Provision of Accommodation for Gypsy and Traveller Households in Cardiff' (2010).
 - 'Review of Multi-Agency Approaches to Tackling Sex Work/ Prostitution' (2012).
 - 'Meeting Affordable Housing Need' (2013).
 - 'Anti-Social Behaviour' (2013).
 - 'Mitigating the Impact of Welfare Reforms' (2013).
 - 'Provision of Adult Social Care to Minority Communities' (2013).
 - 'The Provision of Services to Adult Carers of Adults' (2013).

- 'Dangerous Dogs' (2014).
 - 'The Impact of Under Occupation of Social Housing (Bedroom Tax) Welfare Reform in Cardiff' (2014).
 - 'Tackling Human Trafficking in Cardiff' (2014).
 - 'Information, Advice and Assistance for mental health service users' (2015).
 - 'Reducing Crime and Disorder in the Night Time Economy' (2016).
- **Monitoring Performance** - Where the Committee has undertaken monitoring of the Council's performance:
 - Director of Social Services and Economic Development. Annual Report 2015-16.
 - Corporate Safeguarding ○ Budget Monitoring Month 4 and Month 6 – Adults Social Services, Communities and Housing, City Operations and Economic Development. Annual Report 2015-16.
 - Quarterly Performance Reports – Adult Social Services, Communities and Housing, City Operations and Economic Development.
- **Briefings outside Committee**
 - Social Services and Well Being (Wales) Act 2014: Performance Requirements and Statutory Duties of Director of Social Services - Workshop
 - Safeguarding of Children and Adults: Workshop.
- **Briefing Papers**
 - HMO Additional Licensing Scheme: Progress Report
 - Social Services and Well Being (Wales) Act 2014: Preventative Services
 - Wales Audit Office: Delayed Transfer of Care (November 2016)
 - Dementia Three Year Action Plan: Progress Report (March 2017).

Over the year, the Scrutiny Committee held 10 committee meetings and wrote 19¹ letters to the Cabinet, officers and external partners, sharing their comments, recommendations and concerns following the scrutiny of items at committee meetings. This included one joint meeting with the Children and Young People Scrutiny Committee, in order to consider the Director of Social Services Annual Report 2015-16.

¹ Not including March letters

Members formed a Performance and Budget Monitoring Panel, which has held six meetings this municipal year, undertaken two deep dives and received a progress report on a previous deep dive. A third deep dive is underway, into the Care Pathway.

Members attended a number of other scrutiny events including: forum meetings for work programming; pre-meetings prior to Committee; and a workshop focusing on Performance Requirements and Statutory Duties of Director of Social Services. In addition, Members have attended training and briefing events, including those on the Social Services and Well Being (Wales) Act 2014, Budget, Corporate Plan, Liveable City, Information Governance, Data Protection and Freedom of Information.

RESPONSE TO WALES AUDIT OFFICE

The Wales Audit Office's February 2016 inspection report for Cardiff Council included the following in relation to Scrutiny:

- Develop an approach to cross-cutting scrutiny (given the increasing nature of collaborative service delivery and governance, and the Wellbeing of Future Generations agenda).
- Consider scrutiny's role in addressing the strategic challenges facing the Council at this point in time.
- Ensure that any vacancies on scrutiny committees are filled quickly.
- Consider webcasting scrutiny committees.

In response to this report, the Cabinet agreed a Statement of Action. This included a 'Review of Scrutiny', with the resultant report taken to Constitution Committee on 2 March 2017. In addition, arrangements to scrutinise cross-cutting issues have been developed by the Council, including:

- Joint committee meetings to scrutinise cross-cutting issues: Social Services; Community Hubs; Alternative Delivery Mechanisms; and Human Trafficking.
- Joint task and finish groups: to consider Community Infrastructure Levy and Alternative Delivery Mechanism.

- Joint scrutiny with neighbouring authorities on issues including Regulatory Services and the Central South Consortium Joint Education Service.
- Agreement that the Policy Review and Performance Scrutiny Committee would take the lead overview role for scrutinising the work of Cardiff Partnership Board, with the other four Committees undertaking detailed scrutiny of Partnership Board work streams.

Vacancies are allocated to political groups under political proportionality rules, are discussed on a monthly basis with Party Group Whips, and, with their agreement, have been offered to other political groups and independent councillors where a party has not wished to take their proportion of seats. Appointments to vacancies on committees is a standing item on all council meeting agendas. As a short-term measure, Full Council in July 2016 decided to reduce the number of members on scrutiny committees to eight Members for the remainder of this Administration. The 2016 Member Survey also explored the challenges that Members faced in filling vacant Committee places. It found a range of challenges, including other Council duties, family and work pressures to be key factors.

Webcasting facilities are in place in County Hall and in the City Hall Chamber, enabling some Scrutiny committee meetings, Planning committee meetings and Full Council meetings to be webcast.

The Statement of Action directed the introduction of webcasting of committee meetings to include one scrutiny committee meeting per month from December 2016. The Scrutiny Committees piloted webcasting between November and December 2016, and the Economy & Culture Scrutiny Committee held the first live scrutiny webcast in December 2016.

DEEP DIVES

Council Housing Void Management

The Committee's Performance Panel met to review progress in delivering improvements in council housing void management, following their deep dive in 2015/16. All sixteen of their recommendations had been accepted and Members were keen to understand the impact of these being implemented. Members were very pleased to note a demonstrable commitment by officers to drive improvements in this area, improved performance in re-let times and consequent improvements in rent loss and the percentage of stock that is void.

Disabled Adaptations

Following a decline in performance in 2015/16 and concerns that performance in Quarter One 2016/17 was showing little sign of improvement, Members met with officers to review plans to mitigate the issues. Members were pleased to find that officers had undertaken a thorough analysis of the issues affecting performance and had a clear plan to address these. Members are recommending to a future committee that it prioritises this area for early scrutiny.

Homelessness Target Setting

At the request of the Director of Communities, Housing and Customer Services, Members reviewed the approach taken to setting targets for performance indicators for homelessness. Members looked at the factors affecting performance to date, known changes planned for 2017/18 and the likely impact of these, and trends in homelessness performance. Members discussed with officers the desirability and relevance of proposed indicators and the achievability of the proposed targets. Overall, Members were content with the proposed targets and the rationale applied.

POLICY DEVELOPMENT AND PRE-DECISION SCRUTINY

Members have undertaken a significant amount of pre-decision scrutiny and policy development work in respect of Social Care and Housing issues as well as Community Safety and Crime and Disorder scrutiny. Details of some of these are provided below and in the next section; a full list of the topics covered is provided earlier on pages 5 and 6.

Domiciliary Care

Members focused on four main areas: capacity, sustainability and contingency; quality; cost control; and future arrangements. Members met with representatives from domiciliary care providers, service users, Care & Social Services Inspectorate for Wales, Councillor Elsmore (Cabinet Member for Health, Housing and Wellbeing) and officers from Social Services.

Members were pleased to note the clear willingness from all parties to work together constructively to address fragility in the domiciliary care market and develop solutions that work for Cardiff. Members noted that the main issue affecting capacity in Cardiff is the ability to recruit and retain good quality, reliable staff; and that this is linked to the fact that care workers receive low pay. Members applauded the planned Carers Recruitment Campaign and the Locality Working pilot. However, Members felt these would not be sufficient to address the capacity issues whilst the inherent flaws in the health and social care system remain. Members were pleased to hear that the Regional Partnership Board is working on these issues and planned to scrutinise this further.

With regard to quality, Members explored how new processes enable the Council to be assured that providers are meeting the desired outcomes required by the client. Members also sought information with regard to 15-minute visits and were pleased to hear officers confirm that the aim is to eliminate 15-minute visits.

With regard to cost control, Members noted that authorisation controls are in place for high cost packages of domiciliary care and that a pressure bid had been submitted for 2017-2018 to meet the rising demographic need for domiciliary care. Members also noted

evidence from service user and domiciliary care provider representatives that it was not uncommon for clients to have to top-up Direct Payments to meet the fees charged.

Members noted that work is underway to develop a sustainable model for domiciliary care, with the licence for the current system due to expire in November 2018.

In her response Councillor Elsmore, Cabinet Member for Health, Housing and Well Being stated that she “*would like to thank Members for their constructive comments*” and provided additional information that Members had requested.

Private Rented Sector Housing

Members carried out several scrutinies relating to Private Rented Sector Housing. These included looking at how empty private sector properties are brought back into use, and looking at the implementation of Rent Smart Wales and of Additional Licensing Schemes for Houses in Multiple Occupation.

With regard to bringing empty private sector properties back into use, Members had noticed a significant dip in the published performance indicator for this and sought an explanation from officers. It became clear that there needed to be resolution about which area now has responsibility for this work, following restructures. At the meeting, senior officers gave a commitment to meet to resolve the issue and to identify resources. It was subsequently confirmed that the meetings had taken place and that the Shared Regulatory Services would undertake this work. As part of the Budgetary Proposals 2017-2018, a bid was submitted for a post that would concentrate on work to do with empty homes.

Members received a briefing on the implementation of the Additional Licensing Scheme for Houses in Multiple Occupation. With regard to Rent Smart Wales, Members requested updates on the implementation, with the latest update scheduled to take place close to the ‘go live’ date. Members invited written submissions from landlord and managing agent representatives, the Students Union and ward Members for those wards with the highest number of students. Members received written submissions from all of these and used these to identify issues to explore with witnesses. Following the meeting, Councillor Derbyshire, Cabinet Member for Environment, wrote stating: “*Thank you for the*

opportunity to attend scrutiny to discuss the implementation of Rent Smart Wales. I value input into the development of the initiative as we strive to improve the service”.

Housing Strategy

Members congratulated officers for producing an evidence based, comprehensive, whole system approach strategy in partnership with Registered Social Landlords, Health and Social Care colleagues and private sector landlords. Members recognised that the strategy would require extensive partnership working to deliver the actions and that involving partners at the start of the process would aid this.

With regard to the content of the strategy, Members recommended more fully referencing the Black and Minority Ethnic communities in Cardiff and the work that will be undertaken to ensure their specific housing needs are assessed and planned for. Members also recommended that: the Strategy reference the Council's Strategic Equality Plan 2016-2020; that it be made clear that 4,220 affordable homes will be provided over the 5 years of the strategy, rather than the life of the LDP; and that reference be made in the strategy to the fact that the design of housing, and of estates, is critical to ensuring high quality, sustainable affordable housing that residents wish to live in and that contribute to resilient communities.

In her response, Councillor Elsmore, Cabinet Member for Health, Housing and Wellbeing, stated that the Housing Strategy would be amended to reference the findings contained in the Local Housing Strategy Market Assessment on the housing needs of BME communities and that links to actions in the strategy would be made clear. Her response also stated that the Strategy would be amended to include reference to Council's Strategic Equality Plan 2016-2020 and to make it clear that 4,220 affordable homes would be provided over the life of the Strategy. She stated that she agreed that *'quality of design is very important in new housing developments and the views of the Committee will be passed on to colleagues in Planning and those working on the Housing Partnership Programme sites. Officers will work with Planning colleagues to ensure this concern is reflected in the final draft document.'*

Recommissioning of Advice and Support Services

Members carried out pre-decision scrutiny of the report to Cabinet on recommissioning of advice and support services. The support services element covered floating support to older people, floating support to generic service users and gender specific support services. To assist their scrutiny, Members invited representatives from a range of providers as well as the relevant Cabinet Members and officers.

Members explored issues pertaining to the following: the way that the commissioning packages might be offered to prospective bidders; the balance between quality and cost in the evaluation of tenders; the level of delegation suggested for commissioning Gender Specific Support; and the need to retain flexibility, and to maintain a firm “learning culture” approach as recommissioning arrangements move forward.

Members made a number of recommendations, including:

- making it clear in the Cabinet report that it was possible for there to be a lead organisation with potentially several sub-contractors;
- ensuring the draft report retains flexibility to allow officers to undertake further research with Welsh Government and other local authorities to see if there are other approaches to the percentage split between quality and cost that would be more appropriate to meet the needs of people requiring these services;
- amending recommendation 4i to include reference to the future role of scrutiny in shaping the emerging recommissioning proposals (specifically for ‘gender specific services’ but potentially for all aspects of the proposals); and
- amending the report to acknowledge the need to keep working closely with providers and third sector partners, to manage any unintended consequences and ensure that any lessons from recent and current commissioning arrangements could closely inform future proposals.

In his response, Councillor De’Ath, Cabinet Member for Skills, Safety, Engagement and Democracy stated *“I very much welcome the constructive and helpful comments set out in the letter. ... All your recommendations have been accepted and changes have been made to the report to reflect this.”*

COMMUNITY SAFETY AND CRIME & DISORDER SCRUTINY

During 2016-17, Members have undertaken the following work to discharge their responsibilities for scrutinising the work of the Crime and Disorder Partnership and community safety in Cardiff:

- received and scrutinised the response to their in-depth Inquiry into how to reduce Crime and Disorder associated with the Night Time Economy in a time of austerity;
- carried out pre-decision scrutiny of a Cabinet report on Recommissioning Advice and Support Services, which included gender specific support re domestic abuse;
- undertaken in-depth scrutiny at Committee on Community Safety and on Adult Safeguarding;
- monitored the implementation of agreed recommendations from previous Inquiries relating to Community Safety, covering: Sex Work/ Prostitution, Human Trafficking, Dangerous Dogs and Anti-Social Behaviour.

Members have also continued to raise their concerns at the lack of performance reports for the Crime and Disorder Partnership; in previous years, Members have received these reports six monthly. A revised quarterly performance report is due from Quarter One 2017/18.

Community Safety

Members welcomed representatives from the Community Safety Partnership (CSP) and the Assistant Police and Crime Commissioner to their meeting to scrutinise partnership working to tackle crime and disorder and community safety issues. Members particularly focused on governance, performance and operational effectiveness re both community cohesion and anti-social behaviour.

With regard to governance, Members explored the impact of the Public Services Board (PSB) on the partnership governance landscape. Members noted that there was general agreement that the new PSB and CSP arrangements are an improvement on previous arrangements. Members explored the relationship between decision making at the PSB/

CSP level and at the constituent organisations' level. Based on the information provided at the meeting, Members recommended that further work is undertaken to clearly and transparently articulate in the PSB/ CSP terms of reference the requirement of each PSB/ CSP member to go back to their respective organisation's decision making bodies when formal decisions are required of these bodies.

With regard to performance, Members agreed with proposals for outcomes based reports that demonstrate the impact of the CSP work. Members observed that it is important to not only have the number of incidents and crimes but also to have measures that show how these are dealt with, for example sanction/ detection rates, prosecution rates, conviction rates and victim satisfaction rates. Members recognise that it will take time to put these in place for all categories and therefore, Members recommended that the Domestic Abuse and Human Exploitation categories be selected as the categories to commence this additional reporting.

With regard to operational effectiveness, Members were reassured by the evidence provided of partnership working re community cohesion and observed that there is clear partnership working to tackle anti-social behaviour where social housing tenants are involved, as either the victims or perpetrators. However, there was not such clarity expressed at the meeting regarding anti-social behaviour in the owner occupied or private rented sectors, where social housing tenants are not involved. Members also recommended that the CSP consider how to ensure a proactive strategic approach is taken to tackling the causes of anti-social behaviour across the city.

The response received from Councillor De'Ath, Cabinet Member for Skills, Safety, Engagement and Democracy, stated that: the Committee would be kept informed of any significant refinements in the area of governance; an addition to the terms of reference would be drafted for consideration by a future meeting of the PSB; from Quarter 1 2017-18 performance reports will also include additional information identified in the Exploitation Work Stream; and there will be a new priority work stream to support the development of Resilient Communities, which together with work to tackle Adverse Childhood Experiences, should strengthen the preventative approach to tackling anti-social behaviour.

Adult Safeguarding

Members welcomed representatives of the Safeguarding Adults Regional Board Cardiff and The Vale of Glamorgan and heard about work to date to respond to the new duties regarding Adult Safeguarding set out in the Social Services and Wellbeing (Wales) Act 2014.

Members recommended that the Regional Board work together to put in place joint training to ensure that all staff who are involved in investigations are able to gather and record evidence to PACE standards, whether or not a criminal investigation results. This is to ensure that the Board acts on the findings of the Operation Jasmine review. This review found that poor evidence gathering and record keeping meant that crucial links were not made; this meant abuse and neglect were not stopped as soon as they could have been.

Members considered the Board's draft Business Plan and recommended amending it to include a table that lists the core functions of the Board and, for each of these, states how these functions will be delivered.

Members believe that the Regional Board has the opportunity to build a relationship with the National Board, with the overall goal of strengthening adult safeguarding across Wales. To this end, Members recommended that the Regional Board agree to recommend to the National Board that the National Board work to ensure that all Elected Members receive DBS checks and that the Regional Board recommend to the National Board that the National Board take the lead in developing and agreeing national data definitions.

With regard to Cardiff Council's role, Members recommended that there is training on adult safeguarding for all Members elected in May 2017 and that it forms part of the mandatory induction training so that all Members have to attend.

Response Awaited

CORPORATE PLAN & BUDGET

At its February 2017 meeting the Committee considered the Council's draft Corporate Plan and draft budgetary proposals for 2017-18. Members noted that the draft Corporate Plan 2017-18 demonstrated the improvements made in recent years in reducing the size of the Plan and making it more focused on clearly setting out the Council's priorities. To assist this improvement, Members recommended further refinements, such as providing contextual information so that readers could understand information provided regarding targets and percentages. Members also recommended the inclusion of a suitable measure and target to show progress in delivering the commitment on domestic violence support services.

With regard to the budget, Members raised particular concerns with regard to community shopping centre regeneration schemes, highlighting the need to have alternative plans in place if commercial tenants are not forthcoming or sustainable. Members detailed their concerns regarding the proposals to review Neighbourhood Partnerships. Members recommended amending the narrative for a saving regarding hospital social work teams, to make it clear that this does not involve a reduction in staff.

Members raised a query regarding the Red/ Amber status for most Adult Social Services savings. Members noted that 100% of these savings have detailed planning status. With this in mind, Members queried why so many savings remain Red/Amber rated for residual risk and savings achievability.

When the Corporate Plan was agreed at Full Council, it included a suitable measure and target to show progress in delivering the commitment on domestic violence support services. Members also received an assurance from the Leader that officers would look to provide contextual information via links, when the Corporate Plan is published on line.

When the final budget was agreed at Full Council, changes were made with regard to the narrative provided for the hospital social work team saving proposal.

MONITORING PROGRESS

Members tasked officers to carry out a review of progress in implementing agreed recommendations across the ten Inquiries undertaken in this administration. The review shows that, overall, 65% of recommendations were fully accepted and all of these have been implemented in full. Another 23% of recommendations were partially accepted and 41%² of these have been implemented as stated in the Cabinet Response. A separate report showing the impact of the Committee 2012-2017 is attached at **Appendix 1** to this report.

MONITORING PERFORMANCE

In response to the Wales Audit Office Corporate Assessment 2014, this Committee established a Performance Monitoring Panel to triage the quarterly performance reports and undertake 'deep dives' as needed, outside of Committee meetings. In 2016/17, budget monitoring was added to the remit of the Panel.

The Panel Members have received a range of reports to facilitate performance scrutiny, monitoring of service delivery and the driving of service improvement for citizens. These include quarterly corporate performance reports, repairs and homelessness performance reports, and scorecard reports for Adult Social Services. However, Members felt that these did not provide enough information to enable them to carry out their role to maximum effect. Councillor Graham Hinchey, Cabinet Member with responsibility for performance, agreed their request that the Committee receive consistent quarterly supplementary reports to the quarterly corporate performance reports, in order to provide appropriate information to facilitate effective performance scrutiny.

The Panel Members reviewed the Month 4 and Month 6 budget monitoring reports and held a special meeting to hear from the Director of Social Services regarding his budget concerns and proposals to address these. This drew on information provided to Audit

² This may increase when NTE Inquiry recs implementation updated

Committee and included Members clarifying the approach taken to demographic modelling of future trends.

Members also received reports from relevant Inspectors, including the Care and Social Services Inspectorate for Wales and Wales Audit Office. This Committee held a joint meeting with the Children and Young People Scrutiny Committee to scrutinise the Director of Social Services Annual Report.

FUTURE SCRUTINY WORK

Over the course of its deliberations this year, the Committee has recommended that the following items be considered by a new Committee for inclusion in their 2017-18 work programme:

- ❖ Social Services & Well Being (Wales) Act 2014 implementation.
- ❖ Integrating Health and Social Care.
- ❖ Housing (Wales) Act 2014 implementation.
- ❖ Disabled Adaptations.
- ❖ Domestic Violence recommissioning.
- ❖ Gypsy & Traveller Site Selection.
- ❖ Direct Payments Support Provision
- ❖ Community Shopping Centre regeneration.
- ❖ Partnership working re Dementia.
- ❖ Domiciliary Care arrangements.
- ❖ Replacement to Communities First.
- ❖ Adult Safeguarding, including the Cardiff & Vale Safeguarding Adults Board Annual Report and the Corporate Safeguarding Report.
- ❖ Performance Reports.
- ❖ Savings Reports.
- ❖ Relevant Audit, Inspection and Regulatory Reports.
- ❖ Cabinet Responses to previous Inquiries.
- ❖ Implementation of agreed recommendations from previous Inquiries.

Impact of Community & Adult Services Scrutiny Committee 2012-2017

DRAFT

Introduction

The Committee has acted as a critical friend to the administration, recommending amendments to policy and resource allocation to drive improvements in services to citizens. It has utilised the work of auditors, inspectors and regulators to highlight areas requiring further scrutiny, such as adult social services take-up amongst ethnic minority communities, care plan reviews and delayed transfers of care. The Committee has scrutinised many aspects of housing, adult social care, regulatory services, community safety and crime and disorder. It has used a range of scrutiny methods including committee meetings, panel meetings, deep dives, and task and finish group inquiries. It has commissioned scrutiny research to provide insight into service user and carers' views and experiences and issued 'Calls for Evidence' to widen the span of contributions to its work.

Over the course of the last five years, the Committee has reviewed its ways of working, adapting these to respond to changes in the scrutiny landscape. This has included holding more joint meetings with other Committees to scrutinise issues that cut across terms of reference, such as the Local Development Plan, Community Infrastructure Levy, Citizen Hubs and Shared Regulatory Services. The Committee has also set up a Panel to triage performance and budget monitoring issues in an attempt to reduce the length of committee meetings.

A summary of the impact of this work is set out below, with details provided further on, in the tables.

Enabling voice and concerns of the public to be heard

A key role for the Committee has been to listen to and hear the concerns of the public. Members have ensured service users, carers, advocates, citizens, partners, ward Members and other stakeholders have been able to contribute at committee meetings and inquiries, either in person or in writing. Over the last five years, over 260 individuals have contributed, with many of these acting as representatives for their groups or organisations and thus articulating views on behalf of many more citizens, for example the Older People's

Commissioner for Wales. In addition, over 280 individuals contributed to our inquiries via surveys, focus groups and face-to-face interviews. The Committee held special committee meetings to facilitate in-depth scrutiny of adult social services for ethnic minority communities in 2013, and to hear from those affected by budgetary proposals for 2016/17. It also participated in a pilot for public questions, held in 2015.

Scrutiny resulted in improvements to the following **strategies, policies, plans and service delivery**:

- Corporate Plan
- Neighbourhood Partnerships
- Housing Allocations
- Shared Regulatory Services
- Ageing Well Delivery Plan
- Day Opportunities Strategy
- Gypsy & Traveller Accommodation Assessment
- Housing Strategy
- Director of Social Services Annual Reports
- Corporate Safeguarding Report.

Scrutiny resulted in improvements to the following **commissioning and procurement exercises**:

- Advice Services
- Domiciliary Care
- Supported Living Services for Adults with Learning Disabilities
- Support Services, including gender specific, floating support and support for older people.

Scrutiny resulted in improvements re **Crime & Disorder/ Community Safety**:

- Improvements to the Community Safety performance reports to include commentary to explain the impact of partnership activity on trends, a summary of the key issues facing Cardiff and, from Quarter 1 2017-18, additional information identified in the Exploitation Work Stream.

- Commitment to hold a briefing for senior officers on the Council's legal obligation under Section 17 of the Crime and Disorder Act 1998.
- Raising awareness re lack of representation of Community Safety across the Council's Directorate Delivery Plans 2016-17: *'The underrepresentation of Community Safety and the identified associated work streams has been acknowledged and, as such, the Resources Directorate Delivery Plan now contains an appropriate action.'* Cllr De'Ath, Cabinet Member for Skills, Safety, Engagement and Democracy.
- Inquiries into Anti-Social Behaviour, Dangerous Dogs, Tackling Human Trafficking and Tackling Crime and Disorder in the Night Time Economy – impacts detailed below.

Scrutiny directly resulted in the following changes to **resource allocation**:

- **2014-15**: Reduction of 50% to the proposed increase in the charge for Meals on Wheels.
- **2015-16**: Commitment to fund existing day centres and drug & alcohol counselling services until alternative arrangements in place.
- **2015-16**: £10,000 to each of the six Neighbourhood Partnership areas in order to assist groups that are in the process of taking on services to support health and well-being in these areas.
- **2016-17**: Commitment to keep Taxi Marshall posts.
- **2016-17**: Additional Neighbourhood Services Technical Officer to undertake work bringing empty private properties back into use.

The Committee also drove improvements to service delivery via the work of its Performance and Budget Monitoring Panel and Task and Finish work.

In 2015, in response to the Wales Audit Office Corporate Assessment 2014 that identified the need to reduce the length of committee meetings, this Committee established a Panel to scrutinise the corporate quarterly performance reports and undertake 'deep dives' as needed. The Panel continued into 2016/17, expanding to include budget monitoring.

The Panel completed three deep dives (management of council housing voids, disabled adaptations and homelessness target setting) with another deep dive underway looking at the social services care pathway. The process of deep dives is supported by the Cabinet and senior management: *'I welcome Scrutiny taking these deep dives into the performance measures'* Cllr Elsmore, Cabinet Member Health, Housing and Wellbeing³.

All 16 recommendations of the **Council Housing Management Voids Deep Dive** were accepted and actioned and the following comment was received from Cllr Elsmore: *'Thank you for your report and recommendations for improving performance in void management. I appreciate the time and attention that the Performance Panel have given to this issue... Your findings indicated a need to review and realign resources for void management. I can confirm that a fundamental review of the resources in place to deal with void properties, and how that resource is structured, will be carried out during 2016/17 to ensure that these properties can be re-let as soon as possible, and to avoid duplication of work and confusion over areas of responsibility'*⁴. Following an update on progress in October 2016, a further two recommendations were also accepted.

The work of the Panel also led to **improvements in performance reports**, as follows:

- Information on PPDRs (Personal Performance and Development Review) and savings to be shown separately for Children's Social Services and Adults Social Services.
- Housing repairs indicators to be included in performance report.
- Homelessness indicators to be included in the performance report.
- Guidance on the use of RAG status developed and circulated to all Directorates to ensure a more consistent approach.
- Confirmation that Amber risk ratings should not be used in Q4 reports.
- Agreement that a supplementary report will be developed to report Adult Social Services performance to the Panel and that Communities will continue to supply supplementary information, adapting it to be analogous to the approach used for Adult Social Services.

Inquiries

³ Letter from Councillor Elsmore to Councillor McGarry, dated 29th October 2015

⁴ Letter from Councillor Elsmore to Councillor McGarry, dated 21st April 2016

During 2012-2017, this Committee carried out **ten** Inquiries, making 145 recommendations aimed at improving service delivery. Overall, 65% of recommendations were fully accepted and all of these have been implemented in full. Another 23% of recommendations were partially accepted and 41%⁵ of these have been implemented as set out in the Cabinet response. Some of the key improvements resulting from the Inquiries are:

- Tightened planning policy to enhance provision of affordable housing.
- Improvements in customer care for those experiencing Anti-Social Behaviour.
- Development of annual programme of analytical work by students to support work to address crime and disorder.
- Enhanced existing work to mitigate impact of welfare reform, particularly in relation to impairment groups and foster carers.
- Improved literature, website and publicity material on Adult Social Services to reflect broader population of Cardiff.
- Improved guidance on Direct Payments, which has boosted usage by minority ethnic communities.
- Raised political awareness of issues facing Carers, resulting in commitments, measures and targets for this being included in Corporate Plan and additional resources being made available.
- Raised awareness of issues re Dangerous Dogs and need for Council to engage in dialogue with Welsh Government.
- Increased the number of tenants identified as qualifying for Disabled Band Relief re Council Tax, meaning their income maximised.
- Formal mechanism established to capture human trafficking cases not reported via the National Referral Mechanism; new private fostering posters; and a commitment from Cardiff Business Council to support work to tackle human trafficking.
- Commitment to develop a Night Time Economy Strategy and clarified lead Member for Night Time Economy.

⁵ This may increase when NTE Inquiry recs implementation updated

Enabling voice and concerns of the public to be heard

Year	Summary	Total
2012-13	41 external witnesses- Committee	41
	72 external witnesses – task and finish groups	72
	Special Committee in January 2013 re adult social care service provision to Minority Communities	
	29 participants in focus groups and face-to-face interviews re Carers	(29)
2013-14	11 external witnesses - Committee	11
	37 external witnesses – task and finish groups	37
2014-15	22 external witnesses - Committee	22
	0 task and finish as part way through IAA and included below	
2015-16	21 external witnesses - Committee	21
	28 external witnesses - task and finish groups	28
	+250 participants in survey and focus groups re IAA	(+250)
	Special Committee in January 2016 to hear from stakeholders affected by budget proposals	
2016-17	29 external witnesses - Committee	
Total		261 (and +279)

DRAFT

Inquiries

Year	Source	No of RECs made	fully accepted	fully implemented	partially accepted	partially implemented	No rejected	Not Implemented
	Inquiry							
2012	Sex Work/ Prostitution	13	12	9	0	3	1	1
	This Administration							
2013	Affordable Housing	13	6	7	5	4	2	2
2013	Anti - Social Behaviour	13	8	11	5	2	0	0
2013	Mitigating Impact of Welfare Reforms	15	14	12	1	3	0	0
2013	Provision of Adult Social Care Services to Minority Communities	15	7	11	6	2	1	1
2013	Carers	18	9	15	6	0	3	3
2014	Dangerous Dogs	20	18	18	2	1	0	1
2014	Welfare Reform Bedroom Tax	10	8	9	2	1	0	0
2014	Tackling Trafficking	16	12	11	1	1	3	4
2015	Information, Assistance and Advice to mental health service users	10	0	TBC	3	TBC	6	TBC
2016	Reducing crime and disorder in Night Time Economy	15	12	TBC	3	TBC	0	TBC
	This Administration	145	94	94	34	14	15	11
	As a percentage		65%	65%	23%	10%	10%	

Some recommendations that were partially accepted have been implemented in full. In the case of Carers and Provision of Services to Ethnic Minority Communities, this is because the recommendations accord with the Social Services and Well Being (Wales) Act 2014, which authorities have to implement. I am checking whether this also applies to IAA to mental health service users. I am also checking re implementation of NTE recommendations.

Deep Dive

	Deep Dive	No of Recs	No of Recs accepted
2015	Council Housing Void Management	16	16
2016	Disabled Adaptations	0	n/a
2016	Homelessness Target Setting	0	n/a
2016	Care Pathway	underway	

Scrutiny at Committee Meetings	Impact
Review of Advice Services 2012-13	The Cabinet Member for Communities, Housing & Social Justice welcomed the pre-decision scrutiny and the presentation of this report to the Cabinet was delayed in order for the Committee's views to be incorporated into proposals.
Building Communities White Paper 2013-14	The Committee's recommendations were accepted and acted on, leading to role profiles, clarification that the Local Government Code of Conduct for Members would apply and a proposed re-launch once Lead Members were in post.
Housing Allocations Policy 2013-14	Members recommended that effective indicators were put in place to monitor the impact of the new policy, to see whether the aims were reflected in the implementation or whether there were unintended consequences. This recommendation was accepted and implemented. The monitoring highlighted that further amendments to the Housing Allocations Policy were required, resulting in an amended Policy.
Budget Proposals for 2014/15	Members noted with concern that the proposed increase in the charge for Meals on Wheels may result in people eating less healthily; the proposed increase in cost was reduced by half in the final budget.
Domiciliary Care 2014/15	Members recommended that the Cabinet report be amended to include more details on the proposed timeline, cost envelope, cost of technology required, how outcomes would be evaluated and the interface between the proposed model and Direct Payments. These recommendations were accepted and additional information was provided.

<p>Domiciliary Care 2014/15</p>	<p>In September 2014, Members received a progress report on implementation of the new model and further details on the proposed Provider Quality Score, contract monitoring and financial risk monitoring, as requested. Following discussion at the meeting, Members remained concerned that the proposals did not provide sufficient controls for finance or quality.</p>
<p>Supported Living Services for Adults with Learning Disabilities</p>	<p>The Committee's letter and Cabinet Member response (which contained the additional evidence requested) were placed before Cabinet at the time of their deliberation. The Cabinet Member also stated that she would work with officers to review the tender specification so that it explicitly reflected the points raised by Committee with regard to the lead provider.</p>
<p>Shared Regulatory Services proposals</p>	<p>The Leader stated that he was extremely grateful for the Committee's general support for the proposals and their comments, which were considered prior to a decision being made. The response stated that: the report to Cabinet would be amended as requested; the Leader would ask officers to arrange meetings with relevant scrutiny chairs to consider establishing a joint scrutiny panel; that significant work would be undertaken regarding terms and conditions of transferring staff, which would be subject to consultation with staff and trades unions; that the three year Business Plan for the new service will identify further savings for the short and medium term; that HMO figures would be revisited; that officers are learning from other collaborative approaches to avoid repeating mistakes with regard to ICT.</p>
<p>Budget Proposals for 2015/16</p>	<p>Members noted with concern the scale of proposed savings for Health and Social Care, both in terms of the impact these could have and in terms of their achievability. Members raised particular concerns with regard to proposed savings from closing day centres for older people, reorganising meals on wheels and ceasing counselling services run by the Drug and Alcohol team. When the final budget was agreed at Full Council, changes were made to the day centres and counselling services proposals to ensure existing services would be funded until alternative arrangements were put in place. Members also stated their concerns about the cumulative impact of proposed savings relating to corporate partnership working and neighbourhood partnership working. When the final budget was agreed at Full Council, changes were also made to provide £10,000 to each of the six Neighbourhood Partnership areas in order to assist groups that are in the process of taking on services to support health and well-being in these areas, as per the Committee's recommendation.</p>

Performance scrutiny 2014/15	The following recommendations were accepted: recording and analysing the reasons why carers refuse an offer of a carer's assessment; improvements to the Community Safety performance reports to include commentary to explain the impact of partnership activity on trends and a summary of the key issues facing Cardiff; and that officers work with the Prison Service to quantify and mitigate the impact of the changes flowing from the Housing (Wales) Act 2014.
Ageing Well Delivery Plan	The Cabinet Members accepted the recommendations with regard to the Local Ageing Well Delivery Plan and a revised Plan was submitted to Cabinet for approval in March 2016.
Day Opportunities Strategy 2015/16 (Older People and other vulnerable service users)	Members raised their concerns about proposals to close all day centres. Members were therefore pleased these had been revised and that it was now planned to keep three-day centres, create a Day Opportunities team and signpost to community provision using a tiered approach. The final proposals were significantly amended, with a motion at Full Council committing the Council to fund places for existing service users of Oldwell Court until such time as the arrangements are no longer required and committing the Council to work with the organisation that runs the dementia centre to help them secure their accommodation into the future
Gypsy & Traveller Accommodation Assessment	Members recommended clarifications be made to the Accommodation Assessment to better explain the reasoning behind some of the calculations. Members also recommended that the use of wording in the site assessment criteria be checked with the Planning Inspector to ensure it was appropriate. These recommendations were accepted by the Cabinet Members, with the Accommodation Assessment and Site Selection Criteria being amended accordingly before being taken to Cabinet, thus strengthening both documents and making their implementation more straight-forward.
Corporate Plan and Budget Scrutiny 2015/16	Members drew attention to the Council's responsibility to mainstream and embed community safety within all Council services as a legal obligation under Section 17 of the Crime and Disorder Act 1998 and recommended that senior officers be made aware of the above, in order that proposals being developed by officers properly reflect the requirement on the Council to promote Community Safety. The Leader confirmed that a briefing would be held for senior officers on the Council's legal obligation under Section 17 of the Crime and Disorder Act 1998.
Corporate Plan scrutiny 2015/16	When the Corporate Plan was agreed at Full Council, it included amendments to improve the links between the commitments contained within the Corporate Plan and the What Matters Strategy as well as to some of the measuring progress sections, as recommended by CASSC.

Budget Scrutiny 2015/16	When the final budget was agreed at Full Council, changes were made with regard to Taxi Marshal posts in the savings proposals and Employee Implications report, as well as with regard to the use of Business Improvement District funding and CCTV cameras, in line with recommendations made by CASSC.
Performance Scrutiny 2015/16	Members raised their concerns at the lack of performance reports for the crime and disorder partnership; in previous years, Members have received these reports six monthly. The new Head of Partnerships and Performance has committed to addressing this shortfall and Members expect to receive performance reports for 2016/17.

Inquiries	Main Impacts
Sex Work/ Prostitution	Received thanks from Cardiff Partnership Manager for undertaking inquiry, raising awareness, promoting issues and identifying pros and cons of possible approaches. The Cabinet Response states that <i>'The work of the Task & Finish Group has been invaluable in informing the development of the multi-agency approach to tackling sex work and prostitution'</i> .
Affordable Housing	Housing Strategy has adopted a whole system approach. Report produced re under occupation and overcrowding. Tightened planning policy to enhance provision of affordable housing.
Anti-Social Behaviour	Led to improvements in customer care including: leaflets being published providing advice and guidance on how to be a good neighbour, how to report ASB and the support available when going to court; clearer adherence to timescales; and one contact number for ASB. Led to partnership work with Cardiff University for their students to work on analysing crime trends at a ward level. Led to yearly programme of analytical work.
Mitigating Impact of Welfare Reforms	Enhanced communications and marketing to low income households to ensure they are aware of help available. Ensured digital inclusion covers specific impairment groups. Ensured appropriate areas involved in work, including education and children's services. Ensured Foster Carers got the extra welfare benefits entitled to.
Provision of ASC Services to Minority Com	All literature and publicity reviewed to reflect the broader population. Website has function to enable community languages to be chosen. Mandatory training for staff on equality & diversity awareness. New guidance on Direct Payments has helped boost usage by Minority Ethnic communities.

Carers	Raised political awareness of issues facing Carers, resulting in commitments, measures and targets for this being included in Corporate Plan and additional resources being made available. Members thanked the Director of Health & Social Care for her statement that she welcomed the leadership demonstrated by scrutiny in providing challenge on these issues and the consequent need for leadership from the Cabinet to shape their response.
Dangerous Dogs	Raised awareness of issues and need for Council to engage in dialogue with Welsh Government.
Welfare Reform Bedroom Tax	As a result of R7, 19 tenants identified as qualifying for Disabled Band Relief re Council Tax - meaning income maximised. Council also put in place system to identify eligible households in the future.
Tackling Human Trafficking	Formal mechanism established to capture cases not reported via the National Referral Mechanism. Refreshed awareness raising training for staff, including education/ schools staff. New private fostering posters. Commitment received from Cardiff Business Council that supportive of work to tackle human trafficking.
Reducing crime and disorder in NTE	Drew attention to need to respond to Welsh Government consultation on Framework for Managing the Night Time Economy. Led to commitment to develop a Night Time Economy. Clarified lead Member for Night Time Economy.

Year	Source	Positive Comments/ Action
2015/16	Cabinet Member Letter	
29/10/2015	Cllr Elsmore	'We welcome your observations and recommendations (re Local Ageing Well Plan and Older People's Housing Strategy)..on the whole we agree with comments from the committee, which will inform future changes to this document... I hope that not only will this committee be kept informed but will provide a key role as a critical friends while we undergo these significant changes.'
25/11/2015	Cllr Elsmore	'I regard scrutiny as a key stakeholder in considering the narrative for adult social care'
14/01/2016	Cllr Elsmore and Cllr Patel	'In order to accord with the LDP Inspectors recommendation, we confirm that the wording in the (Gypsy & Traveller) site assessment criteria will be changed from 'contaminated land' to 'land contamination' as recommended.'
12/02/2016	Cllr Elsmore	'Thank you for bringing the issue with the signage at Marland House to our attention. I can confirm that new, significantly larger signs have been put in the windows of the old Advice Hub to direct service users to the new Central Library Hub.'
31/05/2016	Cllr De'Ath	'A systematic gap analysis will be carried out ahead of the re-commissioning of domestic violence services ... agree that CPS will bring vast knowledge and experience so they will be invited to join the Cardiff and Vale sub-regional strategic group..once again thank you for your input into such a key area'
28/06/2016	Cllr De'Ath	'The Committee's feedback regarding the representation of Community Safety across the Council's Directorate Delivery Plans is welcomed. The underrepresentation of Community Safety and the identified associated work streams has been acknowledged and, as such, the Resources Directorate Delivery Plan now contains an appropriate action.'
14/06/2016	Cllr Elsmore	'I would like to thank Members for their constructive comments (on Delivery Plans).. Recommendations accepted include: including CSSIW area for improvement regarding the quality of residential care; updated actions and milestones for Dementia Friendly City'; and include review of advice services.'

2016/17		
30/06/2016	Cllr Derbyshire	Re bringing empty private sector properties back into use - confirmed that meetings now taking place to identify resources to address these
14/07/2016	Cllr Hinchey	I am happy to accept your recommendations (re Corporate Safeguarding Report) and will ensure both that appropriate changes to the report are made and that the Board addresses the substantive issues going forward'
16/08/2016	Cllr Elsmore	Housing Strategy - Reference will be included in the findings contained in the Local Housing Strategy Market Assessment on the housing needs of BME communities and links to actions in the strategy will be made clear... will update to include reference to Council's Strategic Equality Plan 2016-2020.
07/09/2016	Cllr Lent & Cllr Elsmore	Various amendments to be made to Director of Social Services Annual Report as recommended including future reports to reflect the broader governance structure, highlighting supply and demand issues more specifically where relevant in the future, improving presentation of safeguarding graphs, considering inclusion of adult exploitation commentary and considering inclusion of Inspectorate areas for improvement in the key challenges section of the report.
9/07/2016	Cllr De'Ath	I very much welcome the constructive and helpful comments set out in the letter. .. All your recommendations have been accepted and changes have been made to the report to reflect this. (support and advice services recommissioning)
30/11/2016	Cllr De'Ath	I will ensure the Committee is kept abreast of any significant refinements (in the area of governance re Community Safety)... from Quarter 1 2017-18 performance reports will also include additional information identified in the Exploitation Work Stream'
02/12/2016	Cllr Elsmore	I would like to thank Members for their constructive comments' re domiciliary care scrutiny
14/12/2016	Cllr Derbyshire	I value input into the development of the initiative (Rent Smart Wales) as we strive to improve the service'
19/01/2016	Cllr Derbyshire	we are providing additional resource to the Cardiff Housing Enforcement team in the form of a Neighbourhood Services Technical Officer post and this position will concentrate on the work in Cardiff surrounding empty homes'
Awaiting comments on letters from January 2017 onwards		

DRAFT

Scrutiny Services, City and County of Cardiff Council
Room 263, County Hall, Atlantic Wharf, Cardiff CF10 4UW.
Tel: 029 2087 2953 Email: scrutinyviewpoints@cardiff.gov.uk
© 2017 The City & County of Cardiff